February 26, 2019

ATTORNEY GENERAL RAOUL JOINS MULTISTATE AMICUS BRIEF CHALLENGING FEDERAL GOVERNMENT'S "TURNBACK POLICY"

Chicago — Attorney General Kwame Raoul joined a multistate amicus brief in support of a lawsuit brought by nonprofit legal services provider Al Otro Lado, challenging the U.S. Customs and Border Protection's (CBP) practice of unlawfully denying individuals access to the asylum process at ports of entry on the southern border.

In the brief, Raoul and the other attorneys general urged the U.S. District Court for the Southern District of California to deny the administration's motion to partially dismiss the lawsuit. The brief discusses how the federal government's "Turnback Policy" exacerbates inhumane conditions at the border and causes severe harm to asylum-seekers who, through misrepresentations and intimidation by CBP, are turned away from the border. The "Turnback Policy" is contrary to both the United States' treaty obligations and federal law, which require immigration officials to promptly give asylum-seekers a fair chance to present their claims.

"The federal government's policy of turning away people who are lawfully entering the United States is inhumane and contrary to American values," Raoul said.

Al Otro Lado v. Nielsen challenges the U.S. Department of Homeland Security's "Turnback Policy," mandating lower-level officials turn back asylum-seekers at the border. Under this policy, CBP has used various methods to deny asylum-seekers access to the asylum process including misrepresentations, threats and intimidation, coercion, verbal and physical abuse, and "metering," the practice of putting artificial, daily limits on the number of asylum-seekers allowed to cross the border. In the brief, Raoul and the other attorneys general maintain that such practices unlawfully deter and deny asylum-seekers access to the asylum process and create further harm by forcing them to languish at the border under inhumane conditions.

Raoul and the other attorneys general also argue that states will be harmed by the effects of this illegal policy. States invest their own resources to provide education, healthcare, and other services to immigrants residing within their borders, including asylum-seekers once they are in the country. State and local governments will incur the cost of providing services to asylum-seekers who suffer unnecessary trauma as a result of the "Turnback Policy."

Joining Raoul in signing the amicus briefing were the attorneys general of California, Connecticut, Delaware, the District of Columbia, Hawai'i, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota, Nevada, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, Oregon, Pennsylvania, Rhode Island, Vermont, Virginia, and Washington.

A copy of the brief can be found here.

Case 3:17-cv-02366-BAS-KSC Document 215-1 Filed 02/21/19 PageID.4630 Page 1 of 28

i

1	TABLE OF AUTHORITIES			
2	(continued) Page			
3	Anna Gorman, Medical Clinics that Treat Refugees Help Determine			
4	the Case for Asylum, NPR (July 10, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Gorman-NPR15, 16			
5				
6	Beth Fertig, <i>Unaccompanied Minors Have Tougher Time Winning Asylum</i> , WNYC (June 6, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Fertig-WNYC			
7 8	CAMBA, Refugee Assistance Program, https://tinyurl.com/y2d2nlt715			
9	Catherine E. Shoichet & Leyla Santiago, The Tear Gas is Gone. But in			
10	This Shelter at the Border, the Situation Is Getting Worse, CNN (Nov. 29, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Shoichet			
11				
12	CDPH, Office of Refugee Health, https://tinyurl.com/CDPH-refugee			
13	CDSS, Immigration Branch Immigration Services Funding Tentative Award Announcement (Oct. 31, 2017), https://tinyurl.com/Cal-			
14	DSS-ISawards			
15	CDSS, Immigration Services Contractors, https://tinyurl.com/Cal-			
16	DSS-ISC			
17	CDSS, Services for Refugees, Asylees, and Trafficking Victims,			
18	https://www.cdss.ca.gov/Refugee-Services			
19	CDSS, Unaccompanied Undocumented Minors Legal Services Funding Contractor Referral List (FY2017-18),			
20	https://tinyurl.com/ILS-contractors (including Al Otro Lado)			
21	Christine Murray, Ailing Central American Migrants in Dire			
22	Conditions Dig in at U.S. Border, Reuters (Nov. 28, 2018)5			
23	Cristina Rendon, Salvadorian Woman Nervously Awaits Contact from			
24	Son Seeking Asylum at US-Mexico Border, Fox KTVU (Nov. 26, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Rendon-KTVU9			
25	Cty. of L.A., Dep't of Soc. Servs., Refugee Employment Program,			
26	https://tinyurl.com/LA-refugee			
27				
28				

1	TABLE OF AUTHORITIES			
2	(continued)	Page		
3	Leah McDonald, Mayor of Tijuana Said the \$30,000-a-Day Funding	rage		
4	to Assist with Caravan of 6,000 Central American migrants Is About to Run Out, Daily Mail (Nov. 28, 2018)	6		
5				
6	Maria Atencio, Border Facilities Still Need Fixing After Second Migrant Child's Death, Say Democrats, NBC News (Jan. 7, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/y29foqc9.			
7				
8	F. A. O. D. A. C.: W. 1. D. (D. 20.2010)			
9				
10	Mayor's Off. of Community Affairs, FY 2019 Immigrant Justice Legal	2		
11	Services Grant, https://tinyurl.com/DC-IJLSG			
12	Medecins Sans Frontieres, Forced to Flee Central American's Northern Triangle: A Neglected Humanitarian Crisis (May 2017),			
13	https://tinyurl.com/MSF-N-Triangle(Way 2017),			
14	Mich. Dep't of Heath & Hum. Servs., Refugee Assistance & Services,			
15	https://tinyurl.com/y2ey3u3c	3		
16	Mich. Dep't of Heath & Hum. Servs., Refugee Assistance,			
17	https://tinyurl.com/y9q662ms	12		
18	Molly Hennessy-Fiske, Why and How Are Asylum Seekers Entering			
19	the U.S.?, L.A. Times (Nov. 22, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Hennessy-Fiske	9		
20				
21	Monica Campbell, <i>This Teen Migrated to the US Border to Escape Gangs. He Hopes to Join His Mom in the US</i> , PRI (Feb. 7, 2019),			
22	https://tinyurl.com/y4dxlole	9		
23	N.M. Ctr. on L. and Poverty, Emergency Services for Immigrants,			
24	https://tinyurl.com/y63a98o5			
25	N.M. Dep't of Pub. Health, Off. of Border Health,	2		
26	https://nmhealth.org/about/asd/ohe/obh/	3		
27	N.Y. St. Off. for New Americans, <i>Our Mission</i> , https://tinyurl.com/y5wb8dws			
28				

1	TABLE OF AUTHORITIES			
2	(continued) Page			
3	N.Y. St. Off. for New Americans, Request for Applications, RFA #18-			
4	ONA-32, available at https://tinyurl.com/y3oqjul6;			
5 6	N.Y. St. Off. of Temp. and Disability Assist., Refugee Servs., Overview, https://otda.ny.gov/programs/bria/			
7	N.Y. St., Div. of Budget, Governor Cuomo Announces Highlights of the FY 2019 State Budget, https://tinyurl.com/y6qv2jev14			
8 9	N.Y. St., Off. of Temporary and Disability Assistance, <i>Refugee</i> Services Provider Directory, https://tinyurl.com/y59wxyku			
10				
11	N.Y. St., Pressroom, Governor Cuomo Announces Expansion of Services for Immigrant Community Through Office for New			
12	Americans, https://tinyurl.com/y3yd54sb12			
13	N.Y. State, Off. of Temporary and Disability Assistance, Refugee			
14	Servs., Overview, https://otda.ny.gov/programs/bria/			
15	Nadwa Mossad & Ryan Baugh, <i>Refugees and Asylees: 2016</i> , DHS Off. of Immig. Statistics (Jan. 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Mossad-Baugh			
16	Off. of Refugee and Immig. Assistance, Econ. Servs. Admin., Wash.			
17	Dep't of Soc. & Health Servs., Briefing Book for State Fiscal Year			
18	2018, https://tinyurl.com/y528prka2, 12, 15			
19	Off. of Refugee Resettlement, <i>Unaccompanied Alien Children</i> Released to Sponsors by State (last updated Nov. 29, 2018),			
20	https://tinyurl.com/UAC-state			
21	Opening Doors, <i>Refugee Programs</i> , https://tinyurl.com/OD-refugee			
22				
23	Policy Brief: "Remain in Mexico" Plan Sows Chaos, Puts Asylum Seekers at Risk (Dec. 21, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/AILA-Remain4-5			
24	Rick Jervis & Rafael Carranza, Trump's Immigration Policies Are			
25	Benefiting Smugglers and Violent Crime Groups in Mexico, USA			
26	Today (Feb. 4, 2019)			
27				
28				

Case 3:17-cv-02366-BAS-KSC Document 215-1 Filed 02/21/19 PageID.4638 Page 9 of 28

INTRODUCTION AND STATEMENT OF INTEREST

The States of California, Connecticut, the District of Columbia, Delaware, Hawaii, Illinois, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota, Nevada, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, Oregon, Pennsylvania, Rhode Island, Vermont, Virginia, and Washington (Amici States) respectfully submit this brief as amici curiae in support of plaintiffs' opposition to defendants' motion to partially dismiss the second amended complaint in this matter. The Amici States have strong interests in the issues raised here. They invest significant resources to provide education, health care, and other services to immigrants residing within their borders, including asylum-seekers and asylees, in order to appropriately transition them into life in our States. The Amici States also have a strong interest in ensuring that federal agencies refrain from actions that violate the law and Constitution. Defendants' Turnback Policy harms these interests by causing undue trauma to migrants which will make their needs more difficult for the Amici States to address, and illegally denying members of the plaintiff class their right to petition the United States for asylum.

A number of the Amici States fund not-for-profit agencies to provide services to asylum-seekers, among other immigrants. California, for example, provided over \$41 million in funding for this purpose in the past fiscal year. The District of Columbia provides \$900,000 in Immigrant Justice Legal Services grants to community-based non-profits to provide targeted services—including direct legal

¹ See, e.g., Cal. Dep't of Soc. Servs. (CDSS), *Immigration Services Contractors*, https://tinyurl.com/Cal-DSS-ISC. These grantees include plaintiff organization Al Otro Lado. Last year, Al Otro Lado was a subcontractor of grantee International Institute of LA, and received approximately \$250,000; in the upcoming fiscal year, Al Otro Lado is proposed to receive a similar amount as a direct grantee.

² CDSS, *Immigration Branch Immigration Services Funding Tentative Award Announcement* (Oct. 31, 2017), https://tinyurl.com/Cal-DSS-ISawards.

1	services to asylum seekers—in the District. ³ Massachusetts provides funds
2	specifically to assist immigrants with respect to domestic violence, mental health
3	services relating to torture and trauma, academic and coaching support,
4	employment and business services, and legal assistance. ⁴ Washington's Office of
5	Refugee and Immigrant Assistance provides comprehensive economic stability and
6	immigration services to more than 10,000 refugees and immigrants each year,
7	including asylees and unaccompanied children, using an annual budget of nearly
8	\$28 million. ⁵ Illinois provides funds to assist immigrants with refugee resettlement
9	including short-term cash assistance, health screening, language services,
10	vocational training and employment services, assistance with public benefits and
11	human services, and multilingual mental health services for immigrants who have
12	experienced severe trauma. Virginia provides asylees services and support through
13	the Virginia Refugee Resettlement Program. These services include financial
14	assistance (such as rent, utilities, transportation, and other basic needs),
15	employment assistance, academic integration support (including adjustment
16	services to students and parents and college preparation assistance), individual
17	mentoring for youth, adjustment services to elders, and citizenship and benefit
18	application assistance. ⁷ New Mexico funds several significant border transition
19	³ See Mayor's Off. of Community Affairs, FY 2019 Immigrant Justice Legal
20	Services Grant, https://tinyurl.com/DC-IJLSG .
21	⁴ See FY 2019 Final Budget, 2018 Mass. Acts 154, https://tinyurl.com/Mass-4

22

23

24

25

26

27

FY19.

⁵ See Off. of Refugee and Immig. Assistance, Econ. Servs. Admin., Wash. Dep't of Soc. & Health Servs., Briefing Book for State Fiscal Year 2018, https://tinyurl.com/y528prka.

⁶ See Ill. Refugee Resettlement Prog., FY 2017 Annual Report, https://tinyurl.com/y44vzxx8; Ill. Dep't of Hum. Servs., Bureau of Refugee and Immigrant Servs., https://tinyurl.com/y3ed43xs; Ill. Dep't of Hum. Servs., Ill. Welcoming Centers, Brochure, https://tinyurl.com/y6o453sr.

⁷ Va. Dep't of Soc. Servs., Va. Refugee Resettlement Prog. Manual (Nov. 1,

- 1 programs designed to help newcomers stay healthy, get educated and go to work.
- 2 New Mexico supports new immigrants to become productive community members
- 3 | through its Emergency Medicaid Services for Aliens (EMSA)⁸ and Border Health
- 4 Services programs, among others, which provide services without regard to
- 5 citizenship status. New York allocates millions of dollars to support immigrants'
- 6 access to education, employment, health care, and legal services. 10 New Jersey will
- 7 provide up to \$2.1 million in 2019 for legal assistance to individuals facing
- 8 detention or deportation based on their immigration status.¹¹

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Amici States also provide funding for organizations to assist undocumented unaccompanied minors, many of whom have asylum claims. ¹² As discussed further below, the harms to organizations like plaintiff Al Otro Lado that the Turnback Policy causes in the form of frustration of mission and diversion of resources also

^{2018), &}lt;a href="https://tinyurl.com/y4rxke6q">https://tinyurl.com/y4rxke6q; Va. Dep't of Soc. Servs., More Refugee Services, https://dss.virginia.gov/family/ons/more.cgi.

⁸ See N.M. Ctr. on L. and Poverty, *Emergency Services for Immigrants*, https://tinyurl.com/y63a98o5.

⁹ N.M. Dep't of Pub. Health, *Off. of Border Health*, https://nmhealth.org/about/asd/ohe/obh/.

¹⁰ See, e.g., N.Y. State, Off. of Temporary and Disability Assistance, Refugee Servs., Overview, https://otda.ny.gov/programs/bria/; Jano Tantongco, State Budget Maintains Liberty Defense Project, Free Legal Help for Immigrants, Long Island Wins (Apr. 5, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/y2cxqz43.

¹¹ See FY 2019 Budget Detail, 2018 N.J. Sess. Law Serv. Ch. 53, p. B-199, https://tinyurl.com/y4j2386n.

¹² See, e.g., CDSS, Unaccompanied Undocumented Minors Legal Services Funding Contractor Referral List (FY2017-18), https://tinyurl.com/ILS-contractors (including Al Otro Lado); CDSS, Immigration Services, supra note 1 (noting that CDSS provided almost \$3 million for these services in FY 2018-19). Michigan has two programs for children, including the largest state program for Unaccompanied Refugee Minors (URM), providing foster care services for eligible minors granted asylee/refugee status before coming to the U.S. See Mich. Dep't of Heath & Hum. Servs., Refugee Assistance & Services, https://tinyurl.com/y2ey3u3c.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

impact Amici States, as delivery of these critical state-funded services is impeded.

Thus, the States urge the Court to deny the motion to dismiss and allow this action to move forward.¹³

ARGUMENT

A. The Turnback Policy is Exacerbating Inhumane Border Conditions and Causing Additional Trauma to Already Vulnerable Migrants.

Defendants' Turnback Policy, which forces migrants to remain at the border while they attempt to enter the United States, inflicts significant trauma on migrants who have already been traumatized as discussed below.¹⁴ Media reports have

¹³ A number of the Amici States have challenged the Turnback Policy in the context of its connection to defendants' family separation policy in a lawsuit transferred to this Court in August 2018. Compl., *Washington v. United States*, Case No. 18-cv-1979 (S.D. Cal. June 26, 2018), ¶¶ 2 ("Border officials are unlawfully turning away . . . families [fleeing violence and persecution in their home countries] on the pretext that the United States is 'full' or no longer accepting asylum seekers. This unlawful practice exacerbates the trauma already suffered by [asylum seeking] families"); 58–60 (describing Turnback Policy). Defendants have yet to respond to the complaint in that case.

¹⁴ Defendants have also recently begun to implement a program—originally known as "Remain in Mexico," and since renamed the "Migrant Protection Protocols" (MPP)—under which asylum seekers are returned to Mexico for the duration of their asylum proceedings. See DHS, Migrant Protection Protocols (Jan. 24, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/DHS-remain. While initially only applying the policy to single adults at the San Diego-Tijuana border crossing, Richard Gonzales, *Trump* Administration Begins "Remain In Mexico" Policy, Sending Asylum-Seekers Back, NPR (Jan. 29, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/NPR-remain, DHS has reportedly begun returning families as well. Adolfo Flores, The Trump Administration Has Sent the First Asylum-Seeking Families Back to Mexico (Feb. 14, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/y2sptvew. And DHS reportedly plans to expand MPP to other sectors of the border. Robert Moore, "If the Police Aren't Safe Here, What About Us?" Asylum Seekers Fear "Remain in Mexico" Policy, Texas Monthly (Feb. 7, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/Tex-Mo-Juarez (describing plan to "begin implementing [MPP] at other border sites, beginning with the El Paso-Juárez border"). This new policy will result in still more individuals languishing for still longer in dangerous and inhumane conditions at the border. See, e.g., Am. Immig. Lawyers Assoc.,

1	extensively documented the inhumane conditions outside these ports of entry. The
2	images and stories are grim, as thousands of immigrants, many with young
3	children, have been forced to stay in a makeshift camp at a sports complex, a shelter
4	at an abandoned concert venue in one of the most dangerous parts of Tijuana, and
5	on plastic tarps in the streets waiting to be processed by CBP. 15 After multiple
6	instances of rain, the camp at the sports complex became a muddy pit where people
7	lost their limited belongings. 16 The unsanitary conditions "have raised concerns
8	among aid workers and humanitarian organizations that the migrants, packed into a
9	space intended for half their number, are susceptible to outbreaks of disease."17
10	Many developed respiratory infections due to the wet and cold weather, and health
11	officials also reported multiple cases of lice and chicken pox. 18 Children
12	languishing at the border are becoming ill and not attending school, and families are
13	not receiving basic health and social services that the States would otherwise
14	provide, including mental health treatment. ¹⁹ Local authorities lack sufficient
15	
16	Policy Brief: "Remain in Mexico" Plan Sows Chaos, Puts Asylum Seekers at Risk (Dec. 21, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/AILA-Remain .
17	¹⁵ Catherine E. Shoichet & Leyla Santiago, <i>The Tear Gas is Gone. But in</i>
18	This Shelter at the Border, the Situation Is Getting Worse, CNN (Nov. 29, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Shoichet ; Sarah Kinosian, Migrants at Mexico Border Face an
19	Uncertain Future on Their Own, The Guardian (Dec. 1, 2018),
20	https://tinyurl.com/Kinosian.
21	¹⁶ Kate Linthicum, <i>Rain Turns Migrant Camp in Tijuana into a Miserable</i> , <i>Muddy Pit</i> , L.A. Times (Nov. 29, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Linthicum-LAT .
22	17 Sarah Kinosian et al., Mexico Begins Moving Caravan Migrants to New
23	Shelter but Faces Mistrust, Wash. Post (Nov. 30, 2018),
24	https://tinyurl.com/Kinosian-shelter.
25	¹⁸ Christine Murray, <i>Ailing Central American Migrants in Dire Conditions Dig in at U.S. Border</i> , Reuters (Nov. 28, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Murray-Reuters .
26	¹⁹ UNICEF, Statement on Situation of Migrant Children at Mexico-U.S.

Border (Nov. 28, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/UNICEF-border (noting "limited"

access to many of the essential services [children] need for their wellbeing,

27

resources to help immigrants for prolonged periods and have called on humanitarian organizations for assistance. Recent media reports indicate that conditions have not improved; in fact, "it's clear the government shutdown has only made conditions worse—making the legal process even more dragged out for [asylum seekers] still applying and waiting." Indeed, Amnesty International reported that one of the few shelters available to migrants near Tijuana (the abandoned concert hall) closed with virtually no notice, leaving former residents to wander around outside.²²

In New Mexico, two young children died in CBP custody in the month of December 2018 alone. Jakelin Caal Maquin, a seven-year-old Guatemalan girl, died of septic shock, fever and dehydration on December 8 after seeking asylum at the Antelope Wells designated point of entry and waiting some six hours before being transported the 90 miles to Lordsburg, New Mexico.²³ Felipe Gómez Alonzo, an eight-year-old who attempted to enter the country near El Paso, was held for a week in CBP custody before his Christmas Eve death near Alamogordo.²⁴ The bottleneck created by the Trump Administration's Turnback policy is a direct threat to the

including nutrition, education, psychosocial support and healthcare").

²⁰ Leah McDonald, *Mayor of Tijuana Said the \$30,000-a-Day Funding to Assist with Caravan of 6,000 Central American migrants Is About to Run Out*, Daily Mail (Nov. 28, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/McDonald-DailyMail.

²¹ Elizabeth Espinosa & Marissa Wenzke, *In Tijuana, an L.A. City Councilman Tries to Help While Migrants Face a Complicated and Harsh Process for Asylum*, KTLA (Jan. 22, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/KTLA-Tijuana.

²² D. Parvaz, *The Pentagon Just Doesn't See Trump's Border Wall as an Emergency*, ThinkProgress (Jan. 30, 2019) https://tinyurl.com/Parvaz-Wall.

²³ Angela Kocherga, *Border Patrol Officials Probe Death of 7-Year Old*, Albuquerque J. (Dec. 14, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/y6hh7lys.

²⁴ Maria Atencio, *Border Facilities Still Need Fixing After Second Migrant Child's Death, Say Democrats*, NBC News (Jan. 7, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/y29foqc9.

health of children and families.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

In addition to adverse physical conditions, vulnerable adults and children are exposed to greatly increased risks of crime and exploitation as they wait at the border. 25 See E. Bay Sanctuary Covenant v. Trump, No. 18-cv-06810-JST, 2018 WL 6053140, at *19 (N.D. Cal. Nov. 19, 2018), appeal docketed, No. 18-17274 (9th Cir. Nov. 27, 2018) (discussing "the extensive record evidence of the danger experienced by asylum seekers waiting to cross"). Indeed, the State Department's own travel advisories warn Americans considering travel to Mexico to "exercise increased caution" because "[v]iolent crime, such as homicide, kidnapping, carjacking, and robbery, is widespread."²⁶ A number of Mexican states on the border where would-be asylum seekers are languishing are even more dangerous in the State Department's estimation, designated "Reconsider Travel" or "Do Not Travel."²⁷ Indeed, U.S. government employees are forbidden from driving "from the U.S.-Mexico border to or from the interior parts of Mexico."²⁸ Tragically, in late 2018, two young Honduran migrants were murdered in Tijuana, which is experiencing a record number of homicides.²⁹ And some LGBTQ immigrants face threats of harassment and violence.³⁰ The weeks or months of delay in processing

²⁵ Josiah Heyman & Jeremy Slack, *Blockading Asylum Seekers at Ports of Entry at the US-Mexico Border Puts Them at Increased Risk of Exploitation, Violence, and Death*, Ctr. for Migration Studies (June 25, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Heyman-Slack; *see* Compl. ¶ 46.

²⁶ U.S. Dep't of State, *Mexico Travel Advisory* (Nov. 15, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/St-Dept-Mex.

²⁷ U.S. Dep't of State, *Mexico Map*, https://tinyurl.com/St-Dept-Mex-Map.

²⁸ Mexico Travel Advisory, supra note 26.

²⁹ Mary Beth Sheridan, *While Washington Focuses on the Wall, Mexico Fears Its Own Border Crisis*, Wash. Post (Dec. 28, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Sheridan-Border.

³⁰ Sarah Kinosian & Joshua Partlow, *LGBT Asylum Seekers Are First to Reach the U.S. Border from the Caravan. Now They Wait.*, Wash. Post (Nov. 13,

asylum applications caused by defendants' Turnback Policy will only aggravate the harms these individuals face and increase the amount and intensity of social services the States will be required to provide to them, as discussed below.

The trauma inflicted by the Turnback Policy will exacerbate the trauma that asylum seekers have suffered in their home countries and en route to the border. The vast majority of the individuals affected by the Turnback Policy are from Central America's "Northern Triangle" countries—Guatemala, Honduras, and El Salvador. Compl. ¶ 40. As set forth in detail in the Second Amended Complaint and in third-party reports, the Northern Triangle is one of the most violent regions in the world, with conditions "akin to the conditions found in the deadliest armed conflicts in the world today." Asylum seekers from this region flee from extremely dangerous circumstances, most commonly murders of family members, threats to life or limb, extortion, and domestic violence. Immigrants who flee this violence face additional threats during their journey north. Along the route through Mexico and to the United States, immigrants are injured and traumatized from physical violence, abduction, theft, extortion, torture, and rape, often perpetrated by gangs and other criminal organizations. Unsurprisingly, these experiences have

2018), https://tinyurl.com/Kinosian-Partlow.

³¹ Medecins Sans Frontieres, *Forced to Flee Central American's Northern Triangle: A Neglected Humanitarian Crisis* (May 2017), https://tinyurl.com/MSF-N-Triangle (stating that the level of violence suffered by Northern Triangle residents is comparable to that in war zones, and noting that homicidal violence in this region has led to higher numbers of civilian casualties than anywhere else in the world, including countries with armed conflicts or war); *see* Compl. ¶¶ 41–43.

³² Allen Keller et al., *Pre-Migration Trauma Exposure and Mental Health Functioning among Central American Migrants Arriving at the US Border*, 12 PloS one e0168692 (Jan. 10, 2017), https://tinyurl.com/Keller-Trauma.

³³ Forced to Flee, *supra* note 31; *see* Compl. ¶ 44.

caused high rates of serious mental health issues, including anxiety, post-traumatic stress disorder and major depressive disorder.³⁴

Finally, the harm from the Turnback Policy extends to residents of the States who suffer the anguish of uncertainty as their asylum-seeking relatives are in limbo at the border. Many Central American asylum-seekers have relatives across the country, including in Los Angeles, Miami, New York, and Washington.³⁵ These include the Los Angeles family members of a Honduran family with young children,³⁶ and a San Francisco mother, who has been anxiously awaiting the fate of her 15-year-old son for months, after he was detained by Mexican authorities with other minors as they attempted to apply for asylum.³⁷ These residents of the States are being harmed by the federal government's actions, and the States have a significant interest in ensuring that plaintiffs' lawsuit to stop those actions is heard on the merits.

B. The States will be harmed by the effects of the Turnback Policy.

Every year, the States welcome thousands of potential asylees into their communities who have suffered the trauma discussed above, providing or funding a number of social services to help them realize their potential in their new country. The additional mental and physical health harms caused by defendants' Turnback

³⁴ Keller, *supra* note 32.

³⁵ See, e.g., Molly Hennessy-Fiske, Why and How Are Asylum Seekers Entering the U.S.?, L.A. Times (Nov. 22, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Hennessy-Fiske.

³⁶ Elliot Spagat, *More Caravan Migrants Arrive in Tijuana, Brace for Long Stay*, Fox News (Nov. 15, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Spagat-Fox.

³⁷ Cristina Rendon, Salvadorian Woman Nervously Awaits Contact from Son Seeking Asylum at US-Mexico Border, Fox KTVU (Nov. 26, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Rendon-KTVU; Monica Campbell, This Teen Migrated to the US Border to Escape Gangs. He Hopes to Join His Mom in the US, PRI (Feb. 7, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/y4dxlole.

Policy will make asylees' needs for these services even more intense and challenging to meet, requiring the States to divert resources from other services.

The States signatory to this brief have welcomed over 73 percent of the total asylees entering the United States.³⁸ In the 2017 fiscal year, almost 15,000 accompanied immigrant children (those arriving with their families) received positive credible fear determinations and were released from federal custody, many in Amici States.³⁹ And in FY 2018, 16,746 unaccompanied immigrant children were released from federal custody to adult sponsors in Amici States, 48 percent of the total.⁴⁰ Historically, a high percentage of these children have been found to have viable claims for asylum, although that percentage has dropped in the past two years due the Trump Administration's policies.⁴¹

The States, their local jurisdictions, and non-governmental organizations based in the States will assist the victims of the unnecessary trauma that defendants' Turnback Policy causes, utilizing resources diverted from other purposes. Among other services, the States' public schools will face more challenges in educating students who have been traumatized and needlessly missed months or years of

³⁸ Nadwa Mossad & Ryan Baugh, *Refugees and Asylees: 2016*, DHS Off. of Immig. Statistics (Jan. 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Mossad-Baugh. California receives almost 44 percent of the total, by far the most of any state. Collectively, Amici States New York, New Jersey, Virginia, Maryland, Washington, Massachusetts, and Illinois receive almost 29 percent; the District of Columbia has the second highest number of asylees per capita of any state.

³⁹ See Apprehension, Processing, Care, and Custody of Alien Minors and Unaccompanied Alien Children, 83 Fed. Reg. 45486, 45519 (proposed Sept. 7, 2018).

⁴⁰ Off. of Refugee Resettlement, *Unaccompanied Alien Children Released to Sponsors by State* (last updated Nov. 29, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/UAC-state.

⁴¹ Beth Fertig, *Unaccompanied Minors Have Tougher Time Winning Asylum*, WNYC (June 6, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Fertig-WNYC.

schooling while they wait at the border.⁴² And the States' public health care systems will have to address the increased health needs of immigrants who have not had access to preventative care, vaccinations, and necessary medical care as they were trapped near ports of entry by the Turnback Policy.

Further, the States have invested in specialized services to meet asylees' needs, which will be taxed due to increased need caused by defendants' policy. For example, in California, the Immigration Branch of CDSS has various forms of assistance for certain eligible asylees, including programs that provide cash assistance and employment services, as well as services for unaccompanied minors and victims of human trafficking. Program benefits and services are typically administered at the local level by county social services departments, or through county contracts with local service providers to deliver direct services, including services for elders, integration and language assistance for students, and assistance to unaccompanied minors. One of Washington's state social service programs partners with local governments, community and technical colleges, ethnic community-based organizations, and other service provider agencies to deliver educational services, job training skills, assistance establishing housing and

⁴² See Washington Compl. ¶¶ 229 (citing Plyler v. Doe, 457 U.S. 202 (1982), which requires states to provide free public education to children regardless of immigration status, as well as "various statutory obligations to provide particularized services to high needs students, such as through the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA)"), 230 (citing research showing that "experience of trauma may severely undercut a child's ability to learn and function in the classroom").

⁴³ See CDSS, Services for Refugees, Asylees, and Trafficking Victims, https://www.cdss.ca.gov/Refugee-Services.

⁴⁴ *Id.*; *see also* SF-CAIRS (the SF Refugee Forum), *Refugee & Asylee Benefits*, http://sf-cairs.org/refugee-asylee-benefits; Cty. of L.A., Dep't of Soc. Servs., *Refugee Employment Program*, https://tinyurl.com/LA-refugee.

transportation, language classes, and other comprehensive support services. 45 1 2 Michigan provides cash and medical assistance programs through the Michigan 3 Department of Health and Human Services, as well as employment services, 4 integration services, education services, language services, health-related services, and elderly services through private agencies. 46 Similarly, in New York, Refugee 5 6 Services—part of New York's Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance— 7 provides targeted assistance for unaccompanied minors and victims of human 8 trafficking. These services include temporary cash assistance, health care screenings and medical services, and employment programs.⁴⁷ Additionally, New 9 10 York's Office for New Americans has established neighborhood-based Opportunity 11 Centers throughout the State to provide, *inter alia*, English language courses and business development for immigrants.⁴⁸ 12 13 After weeks or months spent languishing at the border, the beneficiaries of 14 these services will, in many cases, predictably require more (or more intensive) 15 services. For example, despite the Administration's claims that its actions will reduce human trafficking,⁴⁹ international experts have found that policies such as 16 17 ⁴⁵ See Off. of Refugee and Immig. Assistance, Econ. Servs. Admin., Wash. Dep't of Soc. & Health Servs., Briefing Book for State Fiscal Year 2018, 18 https://tinyurl.com/y528prka. 19 ⁴⁶ See Mich. Dep't of Heath & Hum. Servs., Refugee Assistance, 20 https://tinyurl.com/y9q662ms. ⁴⁷ See N.Y. St. Off. of Temp. and Disability Assist., Refugee Servs., 21 Overview, https://otda.ny.gov/programs/bria/. 22 ⁴⁸ See N.Y. St. Off. for New Americans, Our Mission, 23 https://tinyurl.com/y5wb8dws; see also N.Y. St. Off. for New Americans, Request 24 for Applications, RFA #18-ONA-32, available at https://tinyurl.com/y3ogjul6; N.Y. St., Pressroom, Governor Cuomo Announces Expansion of Services for Immigrant 25 Community Through Office for New Americans, https://tinyurl.com/y3yd54sb. 26 ⁴⁹ See, e.g., White House, Remarks by President Trump on the Humanitarian Crisis on our Southern Border and the Shutdown (Jan. 19, 2019),

https://tinyurl.com/Trump-S-B-crisis ("Our plan includes critical measures to

27

the Turnback Policy make migrants significantly *more* vulnerable to these kinds of abuses,⁵⁰ which will increase the need for the States to address the impacts through programs like those discussed above. Indeed, media reports indicate that the policy has been a bonanza for human traffickers, who now charge "increasingly desperate" migrants up to \$7,500 per person to cross.⁵¹

Recognizing the importance of proper legal guidance during immigration proceedings, Amici States fund a number of non-profit legal service organizations to provide free or low-cost legal services for asylum seekers. For example, California funds dozens of such organizations, including plaintiff Al Otro Lado, to provide services including assisting applicants for asylum and seeking other immigration remedies and assisting individuals with removal defense. ⁵² And California's public universities also fund programs that provide legal assistance to migrants seeking asylum. ⁵³ Washington State allocated a million dollars from its general fund for FY 2019 to legal services organizations serving asylum seekers

protect migrant children from exploitation and abuse"); White House, *Remarks by President Trump After Meeting with Congressional Leadership on Border Security* (Jan. 4, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/Trump-Cong-Border-Sec (claiming that current border conditions allow human trafficking of women and children, including "traffickers having three and four women with tape on their mouths and tied up").

⁵⁰ See Heyman, supra note 25 ("Blockaded asylum seekers in northern Mexican border cities, bottled up in those sites with few or no resources or connections, are particularly vulnerable to labor, sexual, and other trafficking").

⁵¹ Rick Jervis & Rafael Carranza, *Trump's Immigration Policies Are Benefiting Smugglers and Violent Crime Groups in Mexico*, USA Today (Feb. 4, 2019), https://tinyurl.com/Jervis-USA.

⁵² See Immigration Services Contractors, supra note 1.

⁵³ See, e.g., U. of Cal.-Davis Sch. of L., *Immigration Law Clinic*, https://tinyurl.com/Davis-immig; U. of Cal. Hastings Coll. of the L., *Center for Gender and Refugee Studies*, https://cgrs.uchastings.edu; U. of Cal., Irvine Sch. of L., *Immigrants' Rights Clinic*, https://tinyurl.com/Irvine-immig

and other migrant populations in the state.⁵⁴ Partially in response to the federal administration's 2018 family separation policy, Washington State directed \$1.2 million to legal services for immigrants.⁵⁵ Among other programs, New York funds the Liberty Defense Project, a State-led, public-private legal defense fund designed to ensure that immigrants have access to legal counsel.⁵⁶ The University of Nevada, in Reno and Las Vegas, provides aid to refugee families, including the UNLV School of Law's Immigration Clinic, which provides deportation defense services to families and unaccompanied children seeking asylum.⁵⁷

Harms to these organizations from the Turnback Policy in the form of frustration of mission and diversion of resources, as stated in the complaint, Compl. ¶¶ 17–23, redound to their funders, including the Amici States, whose priorities and funding decisions are impacted as well.

Amici States also fund qualified nonprofit organizations to provide other immigration-related assistance to individuals who have been granted asylum. These organizations provide asylees access to crucial services such as mental health care, education, and resettlement assistance.⁵⁸ For example, the International Rescue Committee for the City of Los Angeles provides programs that assist asylum grantees with health care, resettlement, economic opportunities, and community

⁵⁴ See Wash. Laws of 2018, ch. 299, § 127(65) (amending Laws of 2017, 3d Spec. Sess., ch. 1, § 128) (Mar. 27, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/yy3rduov.

⁵⁵ See, e.g., Wash. Gov. Jay Insleee, Inslee Announces \$1.2 Million for Civil Legal Aid Funding to Northwest Immigrant Rights Project (June 20, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/y5xdkwfc.

⁵⁶ See N.Y. St., Div. of Budget, Governor Cuomo Announces Highlights of the FY 2019 State Budget, https://tinyurl.com/y6qv2jev.

⁵⁷ UNLV William S. Boyd School of Law, *UNLV Immigration Clinic*, https://tinyurl.com/y4ckoxhk.

⁵⁸ See, e.g., SF-CAIRS, Social Services and Mental Health, http://sf-cairs.org/mental-health/.

integration and development.⁵⁹ Opening Doors in Sacramento offers a literacy program, as well as resettlement assistance and family trauma counseling.⁶⁰ The City of Seattle's New Americans Program is one of 16 different community-based programs in Washington providing employment services, vocational English language programs, food assistance, and application and preparation assistance for the naturalization exam.⁶¹ In New York City, CAMBA provides asylees with counseling, social services, and employment-related training.⁶² After enduring additional trauma at the border, many asylees will require significantly more of these types of services, putting pressure on these organizations and their funders, including the Amici States.

The Amici States' agencies work with impacted local health agencies, providers, and resettlement agencies to provide assessments and other health services to asylees, victims of severe forms of human trafficking, and other eligible entrants.⁶³ For example, the Highland Human Rights Clinic in Oakland (operated by the Alameda County Health System) conducts approximately 80 to 120 health assessments of asylees in California annually.⁶⁴ According to the Clinic's medical director, the vast majority of the patients he evaluates need mental health referrals,

⁵⁹ Int'l Rescue Comm., *The IRC in Los Angeles, CA*, https://tinyurl.com/IRC-refugee.

⁶⁰ Opening Doors, Refugee Programs, https://tinyurl.com/OD-refugee.

⁶¹ See Off. of Refugee and Immig. Assistance, Econ. Servs. Admin., Wash. Dep't of Soc. & Health Servs., *Briefing Book for State Fiscal Year 2018*, https://tinyurl.com/y528prka.

⁶² See CAMBA, Refugee Assistance Program, https://tinyurl.com/y2d2nlt7.

⁶³ See, e.g., CDPH, Office of Refugee Health, https://tinyurl.com/CDPH-refugee.

⁶⁴ Anna Gorman, *Medical Clinics that Treat Refugees Help Determine the Case for Asylum*, NPR (July 10, 2018), https://tinyurl.com/Gorman-NPR.

due to years of abuse and trauma.⁶⁵ These needs will only be increased by the additional trauma that migrants will endure while languishing in dangerous, unhealthy conditions at the border due to the Turnback Policy.

Washington funds a State Refugee Coordinator to ensure that state agencies collaborate with local partners including clinicians, community based organizations, health coalitions, and voluntary agencies to address refugee health issues. In addition, the Washington State Refugee Health Promotion Project is a collaboration between state agencies, health providers, and resettlement agencies such as Seattle Children's Hospital and Lutheran Community Services Northwest to improve health outcomes and enable successful resettlement for refugee populations. In New York, the Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance supports numerous organizations that provide health care services to refugees and asylees, including care for post-traumatic stress syndrome and depression.

All of these state-provided resources will be further impacted due to the increased harms that the Turnback Policy causes to individuals who are eventually able to present their asylum claims and enter the country.

CONCLUSION

Defendants' motion to partially dismiss the second amended complaint should be denied.

22 _____

⁶⁵ *Id*.

⁶⁶ See Wash. Dep't of Soc. & Health Servs., Plan for Refugee Assistance Program, 2015 8, https://tinyurl.com/yxmd2st3.

⁶⁷ *Id.* at 6; *see also* Wash. Dep't of Health, *Refugee Health Program*, *Provider Resources*, https://tinyurl.com/y2z7q38y.

⁶⁸ See N.Y. St., Off. of Temporary and Disability Assistance, Refugee Services Provider Directory, https://tinyurl.com/y59wxyku.

Case 3:17-cv-02366-BAS-KSC Document 215-1 Filed 02/21/19 PageID.4655 Page 26 of 28

1	KEITH ELLISON	AARON D. FORD
2	Attorney General	Attorney General
	State of Minnesota	State of Nevada
3	75 Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd.	100 North Carson Street
4	St. Paul, MN 55155	Carson City, NV 89701
5	GURBIR S. GREWAL	HECTOR BALDERAS
6	Attorney General	Attorney General
7	State of New Jersey	State of New Mexico
	25 Market Street, Box 080 Trenton, NJ 08625	408 Galisteo Street Santa Fe, NM 87501
8	Tremon, 143 00023	Santa PC, INIVI 87301
9	LETITIA JAMES	ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM
10	Attorney General	Attorney General
11	State of New York	State of Oregon
	28 Liberty Street New York, NY 10005	1162 Court Street N.E. Salem, OR 97301
12	101k, 14 1 10005	Salein, OK 77301
13	JOSH SHAPIRO	PETER F. NERONHA
14	Attorney General	Attorney General
15	Commonwealth of Pennsylvania	State of Rhode Island
	Strawberry Square	150 S. Main Street
16	Harrisburg, PA 17120	Providence, RI 02903
17	THOMAS J. DONOVAN, JR.	Mark R. Herring
18	Attorney General	Attorney General
19	State of Vermont	Commonwealth of Virginia
	109 State Street	202 N. Ninth Street
20	Montpelier, VT 05609	Richmond, VA 23219
21	ROBERT W. FERGUSON	
22	Attorney General	
23	State of Washington P.O. Box 40100	
24	Olympia, WA 98504	
25		
	OK2018602965	
26	91076245.docx	
27		
28		18

